

Identifications, misattributions and doubts in editions of Spanish and Portuguese keyboard music of the 18th century

By: Martin Voortman, Walramstrasse 3, D- 65183 Wiesbaden, Germany,
Voortman_Westend@gmx.de

Felipe Pedrell, with his collections *El organista litúrgico español* (1905) and *Antología de organistas clásicos españoles* (1908) was the first to make a modern edition of keyboard works of old Spanish masters. In 1927 Higinio Anglés began the series *Opera Omnia* of the organ works of Juan Bautista Cabanilles. Joaquín Nin edited for the piano in 1925 and 1929 pieces by mostly less known Spanish composers of the 18th century, opening with the discovery of the sonatas of Antonio Soler. From this edition, the pianist Frederick Marvin was one of the first to offer them to a worldwide audience. He went to Spain to investigate in this field and published a first volume of Soler sonatas in 1957. Samuel Rubio published his first volume of Soler sonatas in 1952 and the second one in 1958. The discovery of Spanish composers of the 18th century and all their music sources has been a slow trail progressing since then, and we still await the publication of more surprising treasures. In the second half of the 18th century, increasing amounts of European editions were sold in Spain and manuscript copies of them either lacking or with false authorial attributions make it difficult to distinguish pieces by foreign composers from such being in fact of Spanish or Portuguese composers. In the 20th century a specifically Spanish style of baroque and preclassical keyboard music was often dismissed, the position being maintained that it was imitating the Italian one and even “inferior” to it. The common thought was rather guided to find the fulfillment of the Spanish musical developments of nearly a century before classicism in the achievement of the all-European classical forms and style. The vast collection of source and transcription pdfs available on IMSLP is of greatest help in confirming authorships, as you may see from the hyperlinks. In the last few years, many libraries and archives have provided scans of manuscripts free to read online. An optimised knowledge and therefore a deeper understanding of the composers and their works, sources and connections between all will be possible the day all of the sources are online, all historical and biographical data published together from their sources and an online searching- by- notes engine of free use will allow us to follow specific musical themes. Even if we admit that musicians are always innocent when performing under the editor’s false attribution, every listener barely experienced with that music may keep impressions of pieces which are not Spanish at all- but often by minor composers, yet another problem making a just appreciation of 18th century Spanish repertory more difficult. The list of identifications and conjectures below is what I have been able to write about it until now. Please accept it as constructive information for this purpose and feel free to contact me.

Wiesbaden, January 2022

For further thoughts about the authorship of specific pieces, please see my website:

<https://18th-century-music-spain-portugal.hpage.com>

Joaquín Nin: *Dix-sept sonates et pièces anciennes d'auteurs espagnols : deuxième recueil*, Editions Max Eschig, Paris, 1929

Narciso Casanovas, Sonata in F major, is the 3rd movement of Sonata I (Op. 1 /2) by Giovanni Battista Grazioli https://it.wikipedia.org/wiki/Giovanni_Battista_Grazioli

Cantallos, Sonata in c minor: is the sonata [R 60b](#) by Antonio Soler. We don't know from which source it was edited by Nin, but in the Biblioteca de Catalunya in Barcelona there are two sources with this sonata, including the Cantabile (R 60a): M 932/ 1, p. 11 and M 1964, f. 36v.

Macario Santiago Kastner, [Cravistas Portugueses, vol. 1](#) B. Schott's Söhne, Mainz, 1935.

João de Sousa Carvalho, Sonata em sol menor: Corresponds to [sonata Op. 1 nr. 5 by Mattia Vento](#) for harpsichord and violín, edited in London in 1767. See the [article](#) by João Pedro d' Alvarenga (1995) for more information about Lisbon sources and the authorship of the sonatas attributed to Sousa Carvalho. Regarding the sonata in F major, see below at Doderer, 1972.

José Antonio de Donostia: *Música de tecla en el País Vasco. Siglo XVIII*, San Sebastián: Caja de Ahorros y Monte de Piedad Municipal, 1953; 2ª ed., Lecaroz: Archivo P. Donostia, 1976.

The sonata in C attributed to José de Larrañaga is an arrangement of the harpsichord part of the first movement of [quartet opus 3 número 1](#) of Joseph Anton Bauer (1725 - 1808). For further confirmation, search for this composer in RISM.

José Climent: *Rafael Anglés, 2 sonatas*, UME, Madrid, 1970

The second sonata in F major is the 1st movement of the [Sonatina Op. 6](#) Nr. VI by Ernst Eichner https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ernst_Eichner (notified by Daniel Laumans)

Antonio Ruiz Pipó: *Música vasca del siglo XVIII para tecla*. Madrid: Unión Musical Española, 1972.

SONATA EN DO MAYOR attributed to José de Larrañaga, included on the pages 5 to 8 of this edition, is based on the harpsichord part of the first movement of [quartet opus 3 número 1](#) by Joseph Anton Bauer (1725 - 1808). For further confirmation, search for this composer in RISM.

Francisco Civil: [Anton Mestres \(s. XVIII\) Doce piezas para clave u órgano](#), Unión Musical Española, Madrid, 1972

I. TOCATA: First movement of Sonata III by [Domenico Alberti](#)

Gerhard Doderer: *Portugiesische Sonaten, Toccaten zmd Menuette des 18. Jahrhunderts*, Organa Hispanica Heft 2, Heidelberg, Willy Müller, 1972, pp. 11-21

2. SONATA: This keyboard sonata in F major attributed to João de Sousa Carvalho is an arrangement of movements from two different concertos for harpsichord, two violins and bass. That from which the second movement is taken from is attributed to Pietro Alessandro Guglielmi. See the [article](#) of d' Alvarenga (1995).

J.V. González Valle: *Serie de música histórica aragonesa, fascículo I* Real Musical, Madrid, 1978

6. Sonata de sexto tono: Third movement of Giovanni Battista Grazioli, Sonata VII (Op. 1 /2)

7. Sonata de sexto tono: Third movement of Giovanni Battista Grazioli, Sonata I (Op. 1 /2)

Dionisio Preciado: *José Ferrer, Sonatas para clave*, Real Musical, Madrid, 1979

8.^a Allegro: Sonata K 353 by Domenico Scarlatti. Jesús Gonzalo López, on p. 10 and 28 of the foreword of *Tecla Aragonesa vol. X*, states that Ferrer's authorship of this and the five following sonatas has not been proven by Preciado on p. IX of the foreword. The group of six anonymous sonatas is written 56 folios further on from the first seven in the source.

Macario Santiago Kastner, [Carlos Seixas, 25 sonatas para instrumentos de tecla](#), serie Portugaliae Musica, Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, Lisboa, 1980

II. Sonata do menor: This piece is a shortened variant of the second movement of a [Toccata by Francesco Durante](#) (notified by Daniel Laumans).

Dionisio Preciado, *Doce compositores aragoneses para tecla (s. XVIII)*, Editora Nacional, Madrid, 1983

8. Sonata en fa mayor: This is the second movement of Sonata II of [Domenico Alberti](#), here attributed to Juan Moreno from the MV. 2.º, p. 281

Rosario Álvarez Martínez: *Obras inéditas para tecla*, SEdeM, Madrid, 1984

2 SONATA en SOL M, D. Scarlatti. This is a variant of sonata 46 of Carlos Seixas published in Macario Santiago Kastner, [*Carlos Seixas, 80 sonatas para instrumentos de tecla, serie Portugaliae Musica, Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, Lisboa, 1965*](#) (notified by professor Lothar Siemens).

4 SONATA en LA M, Francisco Courcelle: This sonata is a variant of one of the unica in the long time missing source (E-Bbc, M 1964) from which Enrique Granados edited 26 arrangements of Scarlatti sonatas for piano. (edition of the unica: <https://www.trito.es/product/es/Tres-sonates-inedites/TR00870>).

Pieces 5 to 9: In the foreword of the edition, the editor decided to attribute to José de Nebra the works printed on pages 37 to 54. At the time of the edition being published, the manuscripts were in possession of the Zárate- Cologan family (La Orotava, Tenerife) without being catalogued. Piece 5 is written on a single leaf, while the other pieces are together in a manuscript. In both sources the complete name of the author is written: José Blasco de Nebra, cousin of José de Nebra Blasco, organist of Sevilla cathedral and father of Manuel Blasco de Nebra. See the article about this branch of the family: María Salud Álvarez Martínez, “José y Manuel Blasco de Nebra: la otra casa de la familia Nebra” in *Revista de Musicología* XV (Madrid 1992), pp. 775-813. On piece 7 only “Nebra” is written, 8 and 9 appear without attribution. In 2019, this manuscript was to be found in the Archivo Histórico Provincial de Tenerife, Fondo Zárate Cologan, ACZ 301 (provisional signature).

Bengt Johnsson: [*D. Scarlatti, Ausgewählte Klaviersonaten I Urtext*](#), G. Henle Verlag, München, 1985

This edition includes some very doubtful attributions taken from manuscripts of the Arxiu Històric Musical de Montserrat.

21 Sonate in C very uncharacteristic galant style

22 Sonate in G In its surprising simplicity it still fits the compositional style of D. Scarlatti.

23 Sonate in g This is the second movement of the sonata for organ in g minor by Johann Adolf Hasse (notified by Daniel Laumans)

24 Sonate in C Attributable to the Barcelona organist Josep Closells because of the characteristic bass figure from bar 7 onwards, and the Da capo- form, employed for keyboard pieces almost exclusively in Barcelona.

José María Muneta Martínez de Morentín: [Música de tecla de la catedral de Albarracín, vol. III](#), Instituto de estudios turolenses, Teruel, 1986

p. 38 – 43: Bernard Viguerie: [Bataille de Maringo \[...\] pour le fortepiano](#) Op. 8, Paris (modified and shortened)

p. 87 JUETES: F.J. Haydn, Piece 1 from [Différentes pièces faciles et agréables](#) published by Artaria, Vienna in 1788 (arrangement of the 2nd movement of symphony Hob.I:81)

p. 91 Adagio: F.J. Haydn, Piece 6 from *Différentes pièces faciles et agréables* published by Artaria, Vienna in 1788 (movement of Sonata Hob. XVII/ 9)

p. 93 Allegro: F.J. Haydn, Piece 7 from *Différentes pièces faciles et agréables* published by Artaria, Viena in 1788 (movement of the 2nd part of the overture Hob. Ia:15)

p. 95 Allegretto: F.J. Haydn, Piece 10 from *Différentes pièces faciles et agréables* published by Artaria, Viena in 1788 (according to Hob. 3/ 41)

[Tecla Aragonesa, vol. I](#)/ **José de Nebra, Tocatas y sonata para órgano o clave** (ed. Romà Escalas, Institución Fernando el Católico, Zaragoza, 1987)

3. SONATA EN FA MAYOR: The same piece is to be found as a sonata by Baldassare Galuppi (edition: <https://www.armelin.it/CollanaGOS/105.htm#CONTENUTO> n° 9, Rossi catalogue: R.A.1.8.10) in a German source. Notified by Daniel Laumans, who indicated as source: D-B, Mus ms 6998, p. 52 - 55 (in the middle, with neither title nor author https://digital.staatsbibliothek-berlin.de/werkansicht?PPN=PPN798868325&PHYSID=PHYS_0054&DMDID=DMDLOG_0006).

Dionisio Preciado: Teclado Español s. XVIII, Anónimos Aragoneses Real Musical, Madrid. 1989

14. Lleno de 5° tono punto alto: The same fugue by José de Nebra was published in 1995 from another source in Tecla Aragonesa, volume III.

[Tecla Aragonesa, vol. III](#)/ **José de Nebra Obras inéditas para tecla** (ed. María-Salud Álvarez, Institución Fernando el Católico,1995)

5. TOCATA EN DO MENOR is a sonata of Rafael Anglés, identified in the [thesis about Anglés](#) by Carlos Paterson (p. 340). The second part is the Verso 2. de 1er tono of the Psalmodia de Rafael Anglés edited by Preciado, transposed one tone lower.

Tecla Aragonesa, vol. V/ Obras para tecla del s. XVIII (Luisa Morales, Institución Fernando el Católico, Zaragoza, 1997)

V. SONATA [EN RE MAYOR], Sebastián Tomás: The same piece was edited from an Italian source as a work by Pietro Guglielmi. <https://www.armelin.it/AMM185Guglielmi.htm> Notified by Daniel Laumans

Manuel Narro Campos, Obras de tecla (José Climent y Rodrigo Madrid, Real Academia de Cultura Valenciana, Valencia 2000)

In the source, the sonatas numbered V and IX to XV in the edition, are attributed to Joaquín Pastrana. These sonatas differ considerably from the pieces of Narro (edited in *Tecla Valenciana*, vol. V) known until now. His name is to be read only on the first of the sonatas. Regarding the style, sonata IV (from which only the first part is written, as of no. I) and maybe still no. II could be attributed to him.

Tecla Aragonesa, vol. VIII/ Música aragonesa para tecla s. XVIII (P. José María Muneta Martínez de Morentín, Institución Fernando el Católico, Zaragoza, 2001)

At first we have to note that this edition could not have been transcribed from E-Bbc, M 123, as is stated on p. 3 in the foreword. That is an older Italian print of vocal music. But E-Bbc, M 923 contains almost the same pieces, in somewhat different order and with variants. All pieces listed below from this edition, except No. 2., are anonymous in the source.

2. ADAGIO, Ramón Ferreñac. It is the first part of the 2nd movement of Sonata Hob. XVI:35 by Franz Joseph Haydn, the first eight bars being transposed from F to C. It is this transposition which could have been made by Ramón Ferreñac.

7. [SONATA]. It is the trio of the Menueto of sonata Op. 1 nr. 1 by José Ferrer. (see article of Luís Antonio González Marín, p. 191 of the edition under the following link).
<https://ifc.dpz.es/publicaciones/ver/id/3764>

16. ADAGIO: In E-Bbc, 923, f. 19r., at the end of the last Pangelingua, is written: “Sige de Laseca” and the same Adagio is copied beginning on f. 19v., just before a “Sonata de Laseca” in C, 4/4. So we understand that both pieces are attributed to Joaquín Laseca. The indication of stops (Corneta, Nasardos) is another sign of Spanish authorship of that time.

17. [SONATA]. corresponds to No. 44 in vol. II of the complete works for keyboard by José Lidón.

18. SONATA: In two different sources and in *Doce compositores aragoneses de tecla* by Dionisio Preciado it is attributed to Diego **Llorente** y Sola.

19. SONATA: It is the first movement of Sonata VII (Op. 1 /2) by Giovanni Battista Grazioli.

20. SONATA: Third movement of Sonata I of Ignazio Spergher, 6 sonate Op. 1 (Venice, ca. 1786) Notified by John A. Collins

>>

23. RONDÓ: Franz Joseph Haydn, piece 5 of [*Differentes pièces faciles et agréables*](#), Artaria, Vienna, 1788 (arrangement of Hob.I; 85 II)

24. [SONATA]: Franz Joseph Haydn, Third movement of Sonata Hob. XVI:35.

26. ALLEGRO: Giovanni Battista Grazioli, Third movement of Sonata IV (Op. 1 /2).

M. Espona (1714-1779) Sonatas para clavicordio o clavecín (Scala Aretina ediciones, 2001)

XVI Allegro: Transposition of sonata in D, K 512 by Domenico Scarlatti.

The sonata is from E-Bbc, M 921/ 16. The sonata published as no. XV is the most Scarlattian, and together with no. XVI, these are the only two in the source which don't have an attribution. Other sonatas which could be by Scarlatti rather than by Espona are: I, II, IX, X, XIV, XXI and XXII.

Edition of Maria Lluïsa Cortada, [Dinsic](#), 2011: Sonatas XIV and XV of Scala Aretina are missing and the identified no. XVI is not included. The numbering of the last mentioned of the Scala Aretina edition (without no. XIV) here corresponds to the sonatas VII, VIII, XV, XVI, V and VI.

A. Soler, 13 Sonatas y un Rondó para clavecín (Scala Aretina, 2002)

VII (Sonata R 121): In the source (E-Bbc, M 791/ 12 – number 36 in the Rubio catalogue) it is attributed to Soler, but this sonata has been edited from other two sources in *Doce compositores aragoneses para teclado* (from the MV 2.º by Dionisio Preciado, 1983) and in *Tecla Aragonesa vol. V* (from Ms. SPD V, manuscript V of San Pedro de las Dueñas, Luisa Morales, 1997). In both editions it is attributed to Juan Moreno y Polo, which seems far more likely.

Sonata R. 121 is also included in: **Enrique Igoa, Antonio Soler (1729-1783) 20 sonatas, PILES Editorial de Música, S.A., Valencia, 2012**. This volume contains all sonatas Samuel Rubio would have published in a volume VIII, together with some newly found ones

Dámaso García Fraile: José Lidón, La música para teclado, vol. II, SEdeM, Madrid 2004)

46. Sonata en re mayor: José Moreno y Polo, “3. Sonata en re mayor 2.º” (edited in *Doce compositores aragoneses...*)

50. Sonata en sol menor: José Moreno y Polo, “2. Sonata en re menor” (edited in “*Doce compositores aragoneses...*”)

51: Sonata en si bemol mayor: Luigi Boccherini, modified keyboard part of the first movement (Allegro con moto) of Sonata No. 1 of [*Sei sonate di Cembalo e violino obbligato, Op. 5*](#) (G. 25-30) (1768) (notified by Takanao Todoroki, 31.05.16)

54. Sonata en re mayor: Franz Josef Haydn, first movement of sonata Hob XVI:37, modified.

Tecla Aragonesa, vol. X/ Juego de 14 flores de música... (Jesús Gonzalo López, Institución Fernando el Católico, 2011)

This volume includes all remaining unedited pieces with attributions to Spanish composers from the vast source MV 1.º until 2011. In its preface (pages 13 to 32) there is a detailed description with the incipit of each piece contained in the manuscript. The following identifications are missing:

4. Georg Friedrich Händel, Fugue of Suite VIII in f minor

22. P. Antonio Soler, Sonata R 48

62. Domenico Scarlatti, Sonata K 353

Marco Brescia: **Libro de órgano de MELCHOR LÓPEZ (1781)**, Consorcio de Santiago, 2011

From page 150 onwards:

Pieza I – Registro igual y suave: José Elías: Pieza I of *Obras de órgano entre el antiguo y el moderno estilo*, 1749. <https://datos.bne.es/edicion/bipa0000179262.html>

Pieza II – Para el Ofertorio: Anonymous unedited piece in the style of José Elías. It is shorter than the 12 pieces of 1749 and employs a similar kind of motifs as in Elías' "Entrada de 4º tono"

Pieza III – Sobre la Salve [...]: José Elías: Pieza VII of *Obras de órgano entre el antiguo y el moderno estilo*, 1749.

Pieza IV – Sobre el *Alma Redemptoris Mater*: José Elías: Pieza VIII of *Obras de órgano entre el antiguo y el moderno estilo*, 1749.

Pieza V – Sobre el *Ave Regina Coelorum*: José Elías: Pieza IX of *Obras de órgano entre el antiguo y el moderno estilo*, 1749.